Legal Studies & History 510:
Legal Pluralism
Prof. Mitra Sharafi • Spring 2015

Course information: TTh 9.30-10.45 • Sewell Social Sciences 6116 • Moodle course webpage (accessible via UW Moodle webpage): https://courses.moodle.wisc.edu
(You must be registered for the course to have access to the course page.)

Instructor’s contact information: mitra.sharafi@wisc.edu • (608) 265-8428 • Office Hours: T 3.30-5pm or by appointment • Office: Law 6112 (after entering the Law School from Bascom Mall, turn right and go to the sixth floor)

Course description: This course explores the vibrant and diverse world of dispute resolution systems in the past and present. The common law—the dominant type of state legal system in Anglophone jurisdictions—is only one kind of law. Non-state normative orders also exist. Like the law of the state, these other orders have rules, ways of enforcing these rules, and adjudicatory bodies that resolve disputes among their members. These systems appear in the clan, tribe, club, school, ethnic group, religious community, profession and trade. The course covers a wide array of non-state actors and orders, drawing upon legal history and legal anthropology. We will examine everything from medieval Icelandic feuds to mafia law, the Tokyo tuna court to dispute resolution among orthodox Jewish diamond traders, and Australian aboriginal customary law to the Kurdish Peace Committee in London. The course compares adversarial and conciliatory models of dispute resolution, along with fault- and no-fault-based systems. We will also explore institutional and justice-based arguments for and against the recognition of non-state law by the state, and strategies to move between legal orders through forum shopping. Interlegality, or relations between coexisting legal orders, is another key theme of the course. We will grapple with relationships of conflict and competition between legal systems, and with the possibility of other relations, including symbiosis, imitation, convergence, adaptation, avoidance, subordination and destruction.
Course Grades & Requirements:

Your final grade will be based upon the following:

- **Reading responses (30%)**: You will be required to write five 600-word responses to class readings (approx. 2 pages each, double-spaced) on the five days when you are “on call” (see below for description of this system). You may choose to write about the day’s “Reading Questions” (listed on the syllabus for each class) or you may decide to write on some other aspect of the readings. These responses are intended to give you an opportunity to explore themes in the readings that are thought-provoking, and to engage critically with the authors’ arguments and approach. They are also meant to provide us with a starting point for discussion in class the following day. Your reading response should address *all of the readings for the day,* connecting them with each other whenever possible. You should do no outside research for the reading responses. Your reading responses will be due electronically (submitted via our Moodle website) Mondays by 12 noon for a Tuesday class or Wednesdays by 12 noon for a Thursday class. Each response will be graded out of 20 points. There will be a 2-point penalty for lateness (=work submitted after 12 noon but before 5pm). Responses that are either too short or too long by more than 50 words will be penalized by 1 point. Failure to include your name, the course name, date, and a title describing your essay’s themes will also lose 1 point. *It is your responsibility to know when you are on call and to submit your reading responses for those classes.*

- **Midterm exam (20%)**: In-class exam on **Tuesday, March 17, 2015**. This will be a closed-book exam held in Sewell Social Science Building’s computer lab, room 3218 (not in our usual classroom).

- **Final exam (30%)**: We will have a closed-book final exam on **Sunday, May 10, 2015 at 10:05am-12:05pm in Sewell Soc. Sci. computer lab, room 3218** (not in the official exam location posted on the university’s timetable).

- **Class attendance (10%)**: Coming to class is essential. This means arriving punctually and staying until the end of class. Arriving more than 15 minutes late or leaving more than 15 minutes early counts as an absence from that day’s class. Arriving late (=up to 15 minutes late) more than three times constitutes chronic lateness and will be factored into your attendance grade. I will take attendance at the beginning of each day’s session. Unless you are missing class for medical or university athletics (and have provided me with documentation) or for religious reasons (with two weeks’ written notice, once classes have started), missing a class will count as an absence. **You will**
automatically fail the class if you have more than six unexcused absences (e.g. without medical documentation) between February and the end of the semester.

- **Class participation (10%)**: you are expected to contribute regularly to class discussions. If you are uncomfortable speaking in class, you should come to see me during office hours in order to express your thoughts on course materials in an alternative setting. Participation is particularly important for the days when you are “on call.” Your performance in our two in-class “Desert Island” exercises on T, Feb.10 and T, April 7 will also contribute to your participation grade.

Disabilities or other medical issues:

- If you have a disability, a learning difficulty or other medical condition that you feel may affect your work in our course, please let me know (with medical documentation) as early as possible during the semester. Any such discussions will remain confidential. The McBurney Disability Resource Center offers special facilities through which students may take exams (for instance, with time and a half), so it is important that you let me know of any special support you may require: [http://www.mcburney.wisc.edu/](http://www.mcburney.wisc.edu/)

“On Call” System:

- **Groups**: Our class will be divided into the following 5 groups of 4-5 students each: red, orange, green, blue and purple. The color identification refers to the color of name card you will be assigned. You should bring this card with you to class.

- **Rotations**: Each group will be on call for five classes over the course of the semester. I have indicated which group will be on call for each class. **It is your responsibility to know *when* you are on call, and to be well prepared for those classes especially. Your reading responses will be due by 12 noon the day before these classes. If you must miss a class when you are scheduled to be on call, arrange with a classmate to switch days**
and inform me of the change, or contact me at least one week in advance so that I can help you coordinate such a change.

Written Work:

- **Format:** Your reading responses and short paper must be typed in 12-point font with 1-inch margins. They must be double-spaced and submitted electronically via our Moodle course page.

Course Materials:

- All readings for the course are available electronically through our Moodle course website. In addition or as an alternative, you may purchase a physical copy of the readings at the UW Law School Digital Print Shop: [http://law.wisc.edu/copyshop/](http://law.wisc.edu/copyshop/) These paper readers will be printed on demand. If you would like a copy to be made for you, please e-mail Linda Taylor at copyshop@law.wisc.edu and allow 24 hours’ preparation time. To reach the UW Law School Digital Print Shop, enter the Law School from Bascom Mall, turn right (“not left”) and take the stairs or elevator down to the 2nd floor. The Print Shop is very close to the elevator, in room 2115 (hours: M-F, 7am-4.15pm, 262-0668).

Technology:

- **Laptop ban:** **For pedagogical reasons, I do not allow the use of laptops or other electronic devices (like iPads and smartphones) in class.** In order to ensure a full and engaged learning experience, the use of any type of electronic device in class is prohibited unless required for properly documented medical reasons and/or arranged through the McBurney Center. Any recordings made of our class (using the medical/McBurney exception) shall be for students’ own study purposes. Such recordings shall only be made with prior permission from me and are not to be made available to anyone outside of our class.

- **E-mail etiquette:** Please e-mail me with procedural and logistical questions only after you have consulted our Moodle page and were unable to find the answer there. (If you notice that something is missing or incorrect on Moodle, I would appreciate an e-mail.) In general, you will get better quality feedback and substantive discussion by coming to office hours. All e-mails should include the appropriate form of greeting and be signed with your name. I will not reply to messages that do not include these basic courtesies. In this course (as in life), you should aim to be clear and polite in your e-mails, delete automatic signatures that are not appropriate, and reread your messages before you send them.
Academic Misconduct:

- **The stakes:** You have a lot to lose if found to have committed academic misconduct. Misconduct during your undergraduate years may be recorded and submitted to future potential employers and institutions for postgraduate study. If you plan to apply to law school or graduate school, you should realize that any academic misconduct could prevent you from being accepted, or from pursuing your desired profession later on (e.g., practicing law). It is therefore critical that you familiarize yourself with UW's policies and procedures governing academic misconduct: [http://www.students.wisc.edu/doso/academic-integrity/](http://www.students.wisc.edu/doso/academic-integrity/)

- **Plagiarism:** Any intentional attempt to claim the work or efforts of another person without authorization or citation constitutes academic misconduct. This includes cutting and pasting text from the web without quotation marks or proper citation, or paraphrasing from the web (or any other source) without crediting the original. I take such actions seriously. If I suspect that you have plagiarized, I may penalize you in grading your assignment. Alternatively or in addition, I may pursue disciplinary measures.

- **Other forms of misconduct:** Because I grade on a curve, cheating by your classmates affects your grade directly. If you believe that a classmate has committed academic misconduct, report it to me.

Course Reading Schedule:

**LEGAL PLURALISM: THE BIG PICTURE**

- **T, Jan. 20, Class 1:** Introduction  
  Film (in class): “Courts and Councils: Dispute Settlement in India”  
  (documentary produced by the UW Center for South Asia, 1981)

  [(optional) see online guide at [http://www.southasia.wisc.edu/sales.html](http://www.southasia.wisc.edu/sales.html)]

- **Th, Jan. 22, Class 2 (red): Big Ideas in Legal Pluralism (LP)**

  *Reading Questions: How have scholars of legal pluralism shifted their focus and approach over time? Identify the two key periods or flavors of Legal Pluralism scholarship described by Merry.*

- **T, Jan. 27, Class 3 (orange): LP's Diversity — from micro to macro**
Qs: (1) On Reisman: What is microlaw, according to Reisman, and why do social conventions surrounding the practice of standing in line count? Identify the basic principle and exceptions that form a part of this practice. How are these social norms enforced? (2) What informal rules of etiquette (that rise to the level of microlaw) have you observed in your own social interactions? Do you find some of these norms unreasonable? If so, why? Have you seen social rules change over the course of your own life, or differ in another society? What happens when there are disputes over microlaw? (3) What kinds of informal rules and dispute resolution systems exist in online communities?

• Th, Jan. 29, Class 4 (green): LP & the Aims of Dispute Resolution

  Qs: The readings suggest that the line dividing the following may not always be distinct: (a) dispute settlement and therapy; (b) dispute settlement and performance arts. Are you convinced? Should state law embrace or discourage this blurring of domains?

• T, Feb.3, Class 5 (blue): LP & Property beyond the state

  Qs: What are the informal rules among Ellickson’s California cattle ranchers for dealing with the problem of stray cattle? How do these norms differ from the formal legal rules of the state? How do cattle ranchers regard state law, as compared to their own norms? When has the interaction of state and non-state norms caused tension, and which system has generally commanded greater authority among cattle ranchers in Shasta County?
• **Th, Feb. 5, Class 6 (purple): LP & Value Systems**

  **Qs:** (1) In what ways did the early kibbutz distinguish itself and its values from societies beyond? How have life and dispute resolution among kibbutzim changed since the 1920s? (2) How did the early kibbutz’s distinct values come to be enshrined in dispute resolution within the kibbutz? When were these systems effective in settling disputes? When were they less so, and why?

• **T, Feb.10, Class 7 (no group on call): LP Desert Island 1 (in-class exercise)**
  o Read the problem (to be distributed in class in advance and posted on our Moodle course page) and prepare answers for class discussion according to your assigned group.

  **COMMERCIAL & ATHLETIC COMMUNITIES**

• **Th, Feb. 12, Class 8 (red): Merchants 1—Introduction**

  **Qs:** The Tsukiji tuna court in Tokyo, Japan is famous among merchants’ courts. In what ways does it operate differently from most state courts? In what ways does it meet the particular needs of traders who buy and sell fish?

• **T, Feb. 17, Class 9 (orange): Merchants 2— Guest Speaker Prof. Stewart Macaulay (UW Law School) on LP and Merchants in the US**

  **Qs:** Given Macaulay’s findings, why do business people ever make formal written contracts? Why do we ever see contract law suits? What does all of this suggest for theories about the rule of law?

• **Th, Feb.19, Class 10 (green): Merchants 3— Minority Trading Communities**
Qs: How do orthodox Jewish diamond traders function so efficiently and effectively in their trade? Consider the risks specific to the diamond trade, the role of trust between traders, and the role of ethno-religious community membership

- T, Feb. 24, Class 11 (blue): Sports 1—LP & Violence in Sports

Qs: “As with religion, the state should not interfere with sports through the criminal law. The state should respect the autonomy and internal rules and institutions of both systems.” Respond to this statement, focusing on sports (we will discuss religion in depth in future classes). Where do you position yourself on the spectrum from “strongly agree” to “strongly disagree”? Why?


Qs: (1) On McLaren: Why have institutional independence and strict liability on doping been controversial areas for the Court of Arbitration for Sport? Identify cases that put both issues in the spotlight. (2) On “Entre Nous”: What non-state and state-based rules and institutions were involved with allegations that Lance Armstrong used banned substances? What counter-narratives has Armstrong advanced to describe his behavior and the use of performance-enhancing drugs in competitive cycling? Are you convinced?

VIOLENT COMMUNITIES

- T, March 3, Class 13 (red): The Feud
Qs: Although the blood feud may look like pure, unstructured violence, scholars have argued that in many times and places, the feud has been governed by rules. What were the basic rules of the medieval Icelandic feud? How and where does the feud or vendetta continue to exist today?

• **Th, March 5, Class 14 (orange): The Duel**

Qs: What social functions did dueling play in Spanish-speaking Latin American societies during the late 19th-early 20th century? What were the rules, and who were the key players? What arguments were made in favor of and against dueling? How did the state attempt to discourage the practice, when it tried at all?

• **T, March 10, Class 15 (green): Mafia Law**
  - Film Clips (in class): “The Godfather” (1972)

Qs: Under what circumstances has the mafia historically provided dispute resolution services? Has it been efficient and effective? If so, why and how?

**RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES**

• **Th, March 12, Class 16 (blue): Jewish Law**

Qs: (1) On Ausubel and Broyde: what special institutions have administered Jewish law throughout history? What made these organs different from the state courts of the host societies in which Jews lived? (2) On Cooper: what is an eruv and how does it enable observant Jews to conform more easily to certain rules of Jewish law? Why did the proposal to create an eruv in the London suburb of Barnet cause
controversy in the 1990s? What groups were on each side, and what were their arguments?

- **T, March 17, Class 17 (no group on call): In-class Midterm Exam (20%)** in Sewell Soc. Sci. computer lab, room 3218. **Please note that the midterm will *not* be held in our usual class location.**

- **Th, March 19, Class 18 (purple): Islamic Law**
  - Sheikh Yusuf al-Qaradawi and others, “Fatwa on American Muslims in the US Military” (27 Sept. 2001), 1-3

  **Qs:** (1) On Weiss: (a) in the Islamic legal tradition, what is the status of legal scholars or jurists, as compared to judges or qadis? How would you describe their relationship with state or political authorities generally? (b) Why does Weiss argue that "sharia" means more than just law? What else does it include, by his account? (2) On al-Qaradawi and others: Are Muslim members of the US armed forces permitted to fight against other Muslims in Afghanistan or elsewhere, according to the fatwa’s interpretation of Islamic law? Why or why not?

- **T, March 24, Class 19 (red): Catholicism and Canon Law**

  **Qs:** (1) On Langbein, Lerner and Smith: What features made canon law (the ecclesiastical law of the Catholic Church) different from English common law during the Middle Ages? What were the strengths and weaknesses of these features? What areas of social life were governed by canon law and when were there jurisdictional contests between the ecclesiastical and common law courts? (2) On “Enemy Camp 2010”: How did Patrick Wall acquire his knowledge of canon law and how did he ultimately use it? How might the story of priestly sex abuse be framed as a story about legal pluralism?

- **Th, March 26, Class 20 (orange): Protestant Christian traditions and Law**

Qs: (1) On Weisbrod: how did religious Utopian communities in the 19th-century US interact with contract law in state courts? What types of parties usually won contractual disputes? (2) On Gordon: What arguments were made for and against Mormon polygamy in the 19th-c. US? What conceptual points of intersection existed between debates over polygamy and slavery?

• Sat, March 28-Sunday, April 5, 2015: Spring Break

• T, April 7, Class 21 (no group on call): LP Desert Island 2 (in-class exercise)
  o Read the problem (to be distributed in class in advance and posted on our Moodle course page) and prepare answers for class discussion according to your assigned group.

CUSTOMARY LAW OF INDIGENOUS, NOMADIC & OTHER PEOPLES

• Th, April 9, Class 22 (green): Indigenous Customary Law in Australia & North America

Qs: Some readers find the Berndts’ account of Aboriginal culture to be condescending and neo-colonial in tone. Others find Riley's article to be so angry that it is polemical and impracticable in its recommendations for the future. Do you agree with either characterization? Why or why not? Consider narratives of the colonial encounter and demands for action. How do discussions of indigenous peoples’ rights and history seem similar or different in Australia and the US?

• T, April 14, Class 23 (blue): South Asian Customary Law

*Qs*: What are the various explanations proposed by scholars for Himalayan fraternal polyandry? In other words, in what ways may it make sense for one woman to be married to several brothers?

- **Th, April 16, Class 24 (purple): LP in Afghanistan**

*Qs:* (1) Afghanistan is often characterized as lawless. What does Barfield say? Do you agree? (2) Distinguish Islamic law from customary norms in the context of Afghanistan. In what ways do these systems occasionally conflict?

- **T, April 21, Class 25** (no group on call or assigned readings, although today’s material supplements Class 26): *Roma Law 1*
  - Film (in class): “American Gypsy: A Stranger in Everybody’s Land” (Jasmine Dellal, 2000)

- **Th, April 23, Class 26 (red): Roma Law 2**
  - Gillian Flaccus, “Two Gypsy clans’ feud over fortunetelling offers rare glimpse into insular culture,” *Deseret News* (7 Dec 2007), 1-3

*Qs:* Describe the substantive rules of Roma law, including key tenets of purity and pollution laws. How do dispute resolution processes occur among the Roma? What types of sanctions exist? What is the Roma view of the state and its legal system?

**IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES**

- **T, April 28, Class 27 (orange): Introduction to Immigrant Communities & Customs**
Qs: (1) How would you describe the relationship between Kurdish communities and the state historically in the Middle East? How would you characterize the relationship between London’s Kurdish population and the state in the UK? In what ways are these two relationships similar and different? (2) Identify notable features of the Kurdish Peace Committee’s methods and case load. When is the KPC most effective?

• **Th, April 30, Class 28 (green): The Cultural Defense**

Qs: What are the arguments in favor of reducing a conviction from murder to manslaughter (thereby reducing the sentence) on the grounds that the accused was responding to some culturally provocative act? What are the arguments against the cultural defense? Which side do you find more convincing? Why?

• **T, May 5, Class 29 (blue): The Sikh Debates**
  o G. S. Basran and B. Singh Bolaria, *The Sikhs in Canada: Migration, Race, Class and Gender* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 14-29
  o “Operational Circular: Head Protection for Sikhs Wearing Turbans” (UK), 18 November 2004, 1-3
  o Audrey Gillan, “‘Proud to be Welsh and a Sikh’: Schoolgirl wins court battle to wear religious bangle,” *The Guardian* (UK), 30 July 2008, 1-3

Qs: How should state law accommodate minority religious practices (or not) in controversies over the Sikh turban and kirpan? Are there important differences between these two types of conflicts (i.e. turban vs kirpan), or do you see them as turning upon the same fundamental questions? Are there important conceptual similarities or differences between the Sikh turban debates and controversies over Islamic dress for women?

• **Th, May 7, Class 30 (purple): Final Review—LP in Current Events**
- readings TBA (stories in the news during spring 2015); to be posted on our Moodle course page

Qs: What LP course themes can you trace in the readings for Class 30? Do any of the readings question or complicate ideas from our course? Do they suggest practical solutions to any of the challenges identified in class? Do you see trends developing in current events that either embrace or resist the idea that law exists beyond the state?

**Sunday, May 10, 2015 at 10.05am-12.05pm: Closed-book Final Exam (30%) in Sewell Social Science Computer Lab, room 3218 (please note that our exam will *not* be held at the official exam location posted on the university's timetable)**